

**Brookings Historic Preservation Commission  
April 28, 2021 Minutes**

A meeting of the Brookings Historic Preservation Commission was held on Wednesday, April 28, 2021 in City Hall. Members attending virtually: Jessica Garcia-Fritz, Matthew Weiss, Janet Merriman, Jon Stauff, and Greg Heiberger. Angie Boersma, Janet Gritzner, and Tom Thaden were absent. Also present Mike Struck, Community Development Director, Gail and Rosemary Robertson.

Chairperson Garcia-Fritz called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m. A motion was made by Merriman and seconded by Weiss to approve the agenda.

**11.1 Review Case Report – 825 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue.**

A motion by Stauff and seconded by Merriman to remove from the table. All present vote aye.

Garcia-Fritz explained the commission tabled action on the item at the April 8<sup>th</sup> meeting in order to obtain additional information. Specifically, the commission sought clarification on the following items:

- For potential of preservation, BHPC would like to see evidence from a contractor that preservation of the windows, to include returning their functionality, is not feasible.
- For replacement in kind, the BHPC would like to see information and drawings on a product that more closely mimics the character defining features of the existing windows, to include the dimensions and presence of multiple frames for the window frame and storm windows or screen casing, and to preserve the proportion of the tracery (grille) so that it remains consistent with that of the existing windows.

Gail and Rosemary Robertson, 825 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue, submitted additional information from Gary LaJoie, owner of Built Rite Construction. LaJoie provided written documentation that in his opinion, the wood window frames were rotten beyond repair and inoperable. Mike Herold, Midwest Glass, provided a written statement acknowledging the company is not aware of a manufacturer providing similar windows. Gail Robertson explained the rope and weight system had been discarded and the voids filled with foam insulation prior to their ownership of the residence.

The BHPC determined based on the submittals from the applicant the windows could not be restored.

The BHPC addressed the second point of replacement of the windows in kind. Robertson explained previous windows on the sides and rear of the home have been replaced with windows very similar to the two proposed on the front façade. Preference is to maintain consistency with the windows while mimicking the historic appearance as closely as possible to the existing windows.

Discussion ensued with emphasis of mimicking the 8 pane tracery on the upper window, ensuring the bottom sill mimics the existing windows.

Robertson explained the window manufacturer provides an option for a 8 pane tracery and is agree with BHPC's comments. The bottom sill can be replicated to closely mimic existing conditions.


Motion by Merriman, seconded by Stauff that the BHPC agrees with the findings of the case report with additional comments. The applicants have provided evidence that repair of the existing windows is not possible due to rot and the poor condition of the windows. Replacement in kind with the new windows

submitted will include a sill and grille (aka light muntins, mullions, tracery) to create eight panels in the upper window to best mimic the proportions of the existing window. The screens/storm window units with inset wood framing and/or floating, plate glass panes separated by a grille (aka light muntins, mullions, tracery) to match the existing windows are not available in replacement windows.

All present voted aye.

Motion by Merriman, second by Heiberger to adjourn.

Meeting adjourned at 5:45 pm.

DocuSigned by:  
  
10F7FEA0B3284E2  
Jessica Garcia-Fritz, Chairperson

DocuSigned by:  
  
58B50636EA89459...  
Mike Struck, Community Development Director