

Historic Preservation 11.1 Review

Community Development
520 3rd Street, Suite 140
Brookings, SD 57006
(605) 692-6629 phone fax (605) 697-8624
rmiller@cityofbrookings-sd.gov



South Dakota State Law SDCL 1-19A-11.1 Review Required

- SDCL 1-19A-11.1 requires local governments to extend certain protections to historic properties listed on national, state or local registers.
- Local governments are not to issue a permit for any project that would encroach upon, damage or destroy a designated property if there is a feasible and prudent alternative that would prevent such encroachment, damage or destruction.
- Projects subject to review under SDCL 1-19A-11.1:
 - 1) Any project which requires a permit and involves the exterior of a structure within a historic district
 - 2) Any project which requires a permit for demolition or moving and which is within a historic district or listed on the National Register
 - 3) Other: Rezoning, conditional use permits, street vacations

Applicant Name: _____ Date: _____

Project Address: _____

Mailing Address: _____

Cell Number: _____ Email: _____

Historic District:

☐ University ☐ Central ☐ Sexauer ☐ Commercial ☐ Individually Listed

1) **General Project Description:** Mount Calvary Lutheran Church is planning an addition and remodel to better serve its growing congregation and support future ministry needs. This church consists of an original 1950 structure with 1958 and 1998 additions. As part of the proposed project, the existing unoccupied parsonage located on the shared lots will be removed to allow for a more cohesive site layout and improved site circulation, accommodating both the new addition and more efficient parking and access. The project includes an approximately 7,000-square-foot addition and an estimated 3,500 square feet of remodeled space within the existing structure. Selective demolition and remodel work will occur in portions of the existing basement as needed to support the new construction and new plumbing lines. The design of the addition is carefully planned to complement the historic character of the existing Lutheran church while maintaining a clear distinction between the original and new construction. The existing church façade will remain largely unaltered, with the exception of a new walk-door and removal of a sign. The removed brick will be salvaged and reused to preserve historic materials. To ensure continued preservation, the existing church will also receive new shingles to protect and extend the life of the structure.

2) Do you plan to repair the historic original materials? _____ Yes _____ No

3) What method will be used in treatment of the historic original materials?

The proposed walk door will require a limited removal of existing brick within the designated opening area. Brick removal will be done carefully to minimize disturbance to surrounding materials. Salvaged brick will be reused where feasible to repair adjacent areas, including the existing wall sign that will be bricked over. Any necessary infill or replacement brick will match the original in size, color, and mortar composition as closely as possible. The intent is to maintain as much of the historic materials as possible while providing the new entry.

Standard #7: Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

- 4) If the proposal includes removal of any historic original materials or exterior features or spaces, provide documentation as to the condition of the original materials and reasons for removal.

Salvaged brick will be reused where feasible to repair adjacent areas, including in-fill of the existing wall sign that will be bricked over.

Asphalt shingles on existing church are deteriorated and will be removed and replaced as part of this project.

- 5) If new materials are proposed, what materials will be used?

Any necessary infill or replacement brick will match the original in size, color, and mortar composition. The new asphalt shingles will be CertainTeed Landmark, Resawn Shake to match the existing shingles.

- 6) If new materials are proposed, what alternatives were considered?

N/A

Include a narrative of all feasible and prudent alternatives that have been considered for the project, describing how all possible efforts have been made to minimize harm to the historic property, including the reasons for rejection.

State of South Dakota Administrative Rule 24:52:07:03: "Alternatives must be based on factual reports, research, tried methods and professional and lay preservation advice. They must also be based on professional assessments of the value and basic structural condition of the affected property and estimates of a range of rehabilitation or mitigative options prepared by people experienced in historical preservation work.

- 7) Is replacement of missing features proposed? If so, substantiate with documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

N/A

Standard #2: The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Standard #6: Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

- 8) Is the project attempting to qualify for State Property Tax Moratorium or Federal Tax Credit?

_____ Yes _____ No

- 9) Does the proposal involve removal or moving of a structure? Please include a narrative of all feasible and prudent alternatives that have been considered for the project, describing how all possible efforts have been made to minimize harm to the historic property, including the reasons for rejection.

The proposal includes removal of the existing parsonage located on the property. This decision was made after evaluating feasible alternatives and determining that removal provides the most prudent option for accommodating the church's current and future needs while minimizing the overall project footprint within the historic district. The design and site plan have been developed to preserve the historic church building. Construction of the proposed addition will keep the church an active presence in the neighborhood, ensuring preservation of the property as a whole.

10) Is an addition or new construction proposed? If so, please describe and include drawing/schematics with proposal.

- ☐ Site plan drawn to scale showing the existing structure(s) and proposed improvements. The site plan should clearly create a graphic representation of the building footprint(s) and any other elements that are part of the request.
- ☐ Elevation sketches drawn to scale showing the proposed changes including description of materials to be used (materials plan).

The Mount Calvary Lutheran Church project is an addition on the south side of the existing church, with limited remodeling of the interior facility. The modest expansion is to create larger sanctuary and main-level fellowship areas, accessible restrooms, and a covered drive-up area for service pick-up and drop-off (particularly for funeral processions). Exterior updates will include new roofing on the existing church and an added walk-door on the east side.

REFER TO State of South Dakota Administrative Rule 24:52:07:04, Standards for New Construction and Additions in historic districts, for additional guidance <http://sdlegislature.gov/rules/DisplayRule.aspx?Rule=24:52:07:04>.

Standard #9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard #10: New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

HISTORIC STANDARDS

Secretary's Standards for Rehabilitation: The Standards apply to historic buildings of all periods, styles, types, materials, and sizes. They apply to both the exterior and the interior of historic buildings. The Standards also encompass related landscape features and the building's site and environment as well as attached, adjacent, or related new construction.

- 1) A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
- 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 3) Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
- 4) Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
- 5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
- 6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
- 7) Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
- 8) Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
- 9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- 10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

SUBMIT THE FOLLOWING

- ☐ Completed Historic Preservation 11.1 Review application form and additional narrative, if needed.
- ☐ If historic materials are to be removed, email color digital photos of the existing structure/property that include:
 - Street frontage
 - All areas affected by the proposed project
 - Photos of rot or decay of element to be replaced or repaired
 - Photos of neighboring properties

Send to: Rmiller@cityofbrookings-sd.gov
- ☐ If an addition or new construction is planned, submit a site plan drawn to scale showing the existing structure(s) and proposed improvements. The site plan should clearly create a graphic representation of the building footprint(s) and any other elements that are part of the request.
- ☐ If new materials are proposed, submit sketches drawn to scale showing the proposed changes including description of materials to be used (materials plan).

(Attach additional sheets as necessary)

Applicant's Signature

Date