

Historic Preservation 11.1 Review

Community Development
520 3rd Street, Suite 140
Brookings, SD 57006
(605) 692-6629 phone fax (605) 697-8624
rmiller@cityofbrookings-sd.gov



South Dakota State Law SDCL 1-19A-11.1 Review Required

- SDCL 1-19A-11.1 requires local governments to extend certain protections to historic properties listed on national, state or local registers.
- Local governments are not to issue a permit for any project that would encroach upon, damage or destroy a designated property if there is a feasible and prudent alternative that would prevent such encroachment, damage or destruction.
- Projects subject to review under SDCL 1-19A-11.1:
 - 1) Any project which requires a permit and involves the exterior of a structure within a historic district
 - 2) Any project which requires a permit for demolition or moving and which is within a historic district or listed on the National Register
 - 3) Other: Rezoning, conditional use permits, street vacations

Applicant Name: Mt. Calvary Lutheran Church Date: August 19, 2024

Project Address: 629 - 9th Avenue

Mailing Address: 629 - 9th Avenue, Brookings, SD 57006

Cell Number: 605-695-2000 Email: gstegeman@swiftel.net

Historic District:

☒ University ☐ Central ☐ Sexauer ☐ Commercial ☐ Individually Listed

1) General Project Description: _____

Applicant plans for major church expansion (8700 sf new footprint / 16600 sf total footprint) along with new drives and required off-street surface parking.

Site Improvements- removal of 2 residential structures (621-9th Ave and 611-9th Ave); new drives and parking (65 total stalls) with covered drop-off;

existing alley (west) will remain with expanded parking; existing alley (south) incorporated into new off-street parking lot (312 occupants = 63 stalls minimum)

New main level spaces- New Main Entry with Canopy, Office Core, Worship / Sanctuary (270 occupants) with access to new Balcony (42 occupants)

New upper level spaces- New Balcony overlooking Sanctuary, max. occupancy - 42; space for choirs, storage and pipe organ components

Renovated existing main level spaces- existing sanctuary converted to Fellowship Hall (272 occupants), new Kitchen, new Restrooms, new Elevator serving all 3 levels; remaining existing spaces converted for gathering / meetings spaces

Renovated existing lower level spaces- converted to Education spaces with improved Restrooms

2) Do you plan to repair the historic original materials? ☐ Yes ☒ No

3) What method will be used in treatment of the historic original materials?

Standard #7: Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

- 4) If the proposal includes removal of any historic original materials or exterior features or spaces, provide documentation as to the condition of the original materials and reasons for removal.

Existing Residence #1 (621-9th Ave) is non-contributing and is planned for demolition; Existing Residence #2 (611-9th Ave) is contributing and is planned to be relocated (final location pending); removal of both structures is essential for this project to proceed. Existing Residence #1 is circa 1960's and has little or no architectural value. Existing Residence #2 is circa 1910's and appears to be in good condition and a likely candidate for relocation per statute.



Mt. Calvary has added these research notes documenting their efforts to-date

- 5) If new materials are proposed, what materials will be used?

Materials of the proposed project (addition) will integrate and complement those of the existing historical structure (church). The goal of this project is a natural and smooth transition from existing to new.

- 6) If new materials are proposed, what alternatives were considered?

As this project is in the very early stages, detailed design considerations are pending. Per #5 above, the goal is a natural and smooth transition from existing to new.

Include a narrative of all feasible and prudent alternatives that have been considered for the project, describing how all possible efforts have been made to minimize harm to the historic property, including the reasons for rejection.

State of South Dakota Administrative Rule 24:52:07:03: "Alternatives must be based on factual reports, research, tried methods and professional and lay preservation advice. They must also be based on professional assessments of the value and basic structural condition of the affected property and estimates of a range of rehabilitation or mitigative options prepared by people experienced in historical preservation work."

- 7) Is replacement of missing features proposed? If so, substantiate with documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Standard #2: The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Standard #6: Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

- 8) Is the project attempting to qualify for State Property Tax Moratorium or Federal Tax Credit?

☐

Yes

☒

No

- 9) Does the proposal involve removal or moving of a structure? Please include a narrative of all feasible and prudent alternatives that have been considered for the project, describing how all possible efforts have been made to minimize harm to the historic property, including the reasons for rejection.

See #4 above. No other alternative exists for this expansion- the 2 residences must be removed / relocated to make space available for city zoning requirements for off-street parking. Mt. Calvary is growing and in desperate need for more space. This church has been a fixture in this neighborhood since its construction in 1960 and plans to continue serving the City of Brookings for generations to come.

10) Is an addition or new construction proposed? If so, please describe and include drawing/schematics with proposal.

- ☐ Site plan drawn to scale showing the existing structure(s) and proposed improvements. The site plan should clearly create a graphic representation of the building footprint(s) and any other elements that are part of the request.
- ☐ Elevation sketches drawn to scale showing the proposed changes including description of materials to be used (materials plan).

See #1 above and attached drawings showing this required information.

REFER TO State of South Dakota Administrative Rule 24:52:07:04, Standards for New Construction and Additions in historic districts, for additional guidance <http://sdlegislature.gov/rules/DisplayRule.aspx?Rule=24:52:07:04>.

Standard #9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard #10: New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

HISTORIC STANDARDS

Secretary's Standards for Rehabilitation: The Standards apply to historic buildings of all periods, styles, types, materials, and sizes. They apply to both the exterior and the interior of historic buildings. The Standards also encompass related landscape features and the building's site and environment as well as attached, adjacent, or related new construction.

- 1) A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
- 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 3) Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
- 4) Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
- 5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
- 6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
- 7) Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
- 8) Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
- 9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- 10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

SUBMIT THE FOLLOWING

- ☑ Completed Historic Preservation 11.1 Review application form and additional narrative, if needed.
- ☑ If historic materials are to be removed, email color digital photos of the existing structure/property that include:
 - Street frontage
 - All areas affected by the proposed project
 - Photos of rot or decay of element to be replaced or repaired
 - Photos of neighboring properties

Send to: Rmiller@cityofbrookings-sd.gov
- ☑ If an addition or new construction is planned, submit a site plan drawn to scale showing the existing structure(s) and proposed improvements. The site plan should clearly create a graphic representation of the building footprint(s) and any other elements that are part of the request.
- ☑ If new materials are proposed, submit sketches drawn to scale showing the proposed changes including description of materials to be used (materials plan).

(Attach additional sheets as necessary)

Gene Stegeman
Applicant's Signature

August 19, 2024
Date

- 28,200 sf hard surface
- 4,000 sf (1st tree)
- 24,200 sf (8 trees @ 3000 sf)
- 9 trees total required
- 20% to parking islands
- 2 trees in islands

**green space
required: 7000sf
provided: 9000sf**



Proposed Site Plan





MT. CALVARY LUTHERAN CHURCH

DATE: MAR 29, 2024

Ground View - 9th Avenue



VANMAN

architects and builders

COPYRIGHT © 2027



MT. CALVARY LUTHERAN CHURCH

DATE: MAR 29, 2024

View from Northwest



VANMAN

architects and builders

COPYRIGHT © 2017



MT. CALVARY LUTHERAN CHURCH

DATE: MAR 29, 2024

View from Southwest

VO+O VANMAN

architects and builders

COPYRIGHT © 2024



DEMO





DEMO







DEMO



DEMO



DEMO

