630 6th Ave Brookings SD, 57006 - Garage SDCL 1-19A-11.1 Consultation Project: 230608009S – 630 6th Ave Detached Garage Location: Brookings COB - City of Brookings

Summary - Due to May 2022 storm damage the detached garage at 630 6th Ave is not structurally safe and needs to be replaced. City of Brookings requested the new garage be turned from its current orientation facing 7th st (North) to open towards the alley (East). Current old garage style does not match the house. The home owners would like to build a new garage structure with complimentary:

Siding/Trim - Hardie Plank Lap siding that mimics real wood siding of the house Roof Pitch Color - Same paint scheme as house Window/shutters - Tall window similar to house / custom identical shutter as house Exterior Door - same as house (Benchmark Craftsmans style fiberglass) Garage Door - Classic steel, standard 8ft Shingles - Identical to house (GAF Pewter Grey) Landscaping - No additions or deletions.

We would like to begin construction of the new garage ASAP due to insurance time limits and availability of contractors, building materials, concrete etc.





Garage Condition - The garage was not in perfect condition when the house was purchased January 2022. The May 2022 Derecho wind storm nearly flattened the entire garage, the structure is now twisting down to the ground, the tops of the wall studs are split. Temporary braces were put up by OJM Homes to slow the collapse. Wall studs, rafters and bottom sill (entire structure) all need replacing. Windows and doors are either gone or rotten. There is one window on the west side that is the only one with a possibility of being restored. We had a few contractors and insurance all agreed it is not safe and beyond repair. Garage can not be moved to another location without collapse. Large side sliding doors are not weather tight, functional or tall enough to be used on new construction. Sliding doors could be donated or repurposed.

Prudent Alternatives - We had 3 contractors and an insurance adjuster come look at the garage to repair it. All came to the conclusion that the garage was too fragile to straighten up. Nearly all of the wall studs, all rafters, siding and entire bottom sill would need to be replaced/reattached or shored up. We looked for options to move in a similar existing historic garage with no luck. I plan on posting the opportunity for pickers to repurpose any parts of the old garage before demolition of the old structure. (lumber, siding, etc)

Cracked wall studs with temporary bracing



Rotten bottom sill



Sagging spliced Rafters and roof line



Structure is collapsing down in a spiral / Doors and windows rotten or boarded up



Physical Description - Damaged garage is a simple 1.5-2 stall garage built by the previous homeowner. 19ftx19ft footprint with a ~10x19ft parking pad on West side. Tongue and Groove siding. Asphalt shingle roof. 1 remaining window of 3 windows and 2 doors. Other doors and window openings were boarded up. Roof pitch is lower than the house but similar to the neighboring garage, 12ft 10in. Large sliding front doors.



5. Economic Information - Insurance is only covering the replacement of the basic structure. Additional concrete for the new setback from the alley, custom roof pitch, paint and other details to match the house are all extra costs to the homeowner. Cost the homeowner is willing to pay to match the house, be to code and be aesthetically pleasing to the neighborhood. (Hardie board comes pre painted, additional cost to repaint to exact house color)

7C - Our preference would have been to repair, but that is not feasible. Next preference is to build a new garage that fits in with the surrounding structures or matches the house. Honestly most of the surrounding garages are of varied looks. We felt if we built something with a similar look to the house (siding similar to the house, similar shaped window, build identical shutters, paint the same color, similar overhang to the house and similar roof pitch) it will have the least impact or most likely improve the aesthetics of the historic neighborhood. Two options for roof pitch have been offered. We are open to suggestions. I feel the steeper pitch compliments the house more. The steeper pitch is more expensive. The lower pitch compliments the old garage and neighboring garage. With new setbacks and new structure the concrete pad on the alley side and garage will meet the cities 50% rule. City of Brookings approved variance request November 2023 (Garage to be in line with house, new structure to be turned towards alley (vs current 7th St facing) and set back from the alley with concrete apron)

HEIGHTS -

630 6th Ave house (North peak) - ~26ft 6in
630 6th Ave old garage - 12ft 10in
Proposed new garage 8/12 pitch (mimic house) - 19ft 9ft wall / 8ft garage door
Proposed new garage 6/12 pitch - 17ft 9ft wall / 8ft garage door
629 7th st garage (neighboring garage across alley to East) - ~13ft 6in

Average height on block - ~25ft Average height of all structures on block - ~21.3ft

TIMELINE - Planning and Approval

House built 1894 Single car garage built 1930? (originally single stall 7ft high) Expanded to double garage 1951 - DIY expansion built by homeowner Bennis (current owner) purchased property January 2022 Derecho Storm damaged roof of house - May 2022 Derecho Storm damaged garage structure - May 2022 State Farm Insurance approved full house roof replacement - 2022 State Farm Insurance approved full garage structure replacement - 2022 House roof and roof decking replaced - July 2022 Bennis finished full interior home renovation (all original plaster, hardwood floors, doors, trim and hardware restored) - Oct 2022 City of Brookings approved variance request (Garage to be in line with house, turned towards alley and set back from the alley - Nov 2023 Lot surveyed April 2023 Garage submission to State Historical Society July 2023 2nd Submission to State Historical Society August 2023 Begin construction (anticipated) Aug 2023 Home recipient of "Excellence in Restoration" Award August 8th

CONTACTS/ADDRESSES

SDCL 1-19A-11.1 Consultation Project: 230608009S – 630 6th Ave Detached Garage Location: Brookings COB - City of Brookings

Home Owner Chuck and Larissa Bennis 1015 Crystal Ridge Rd Brookings SD 57006 605.222.0444 Chuck cell/text bennisartstudios@gmail.com

Contractor OJM Homes Barnaby Wainman Brookings SD 57006 605.695.3981 barnaby@ojmhomes.com

City of Brookings Ryan Miller <u>rmiller@cityofbrookings-sd.gov</u> 605.697.8632

Google Drive Folder of Detailed photos https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1WIpPLozalUgAnMYST2tVyAoagmsmx9Zs?usp=sharing



629 6th AUE







5487th 5t







630 6th AUF

626 6th AUE











Proposed New Garage - 2 options of roof pitch. Option two matches house closer.

1951 Building Permit

APPLICATION FOR BUILDING PERMIT
To The City of Brookings, South Dakota
Applicati
otherwise described as <u>CC</u> Lot <u>Street</u> of Block
otherwise described as
otherwise described as <u>CC</u> by Avenue, Street Brookings, South Dakota <u>Pilerion</u> Second Lot <u>Second</u> Addition to the Second
The name of it
The name of the owner of the premises is Eliver male loss The nature of the work to be done is Build addition 8' × 18' to Ringly gampe to make double our of
a hattire of the work to be deal of the second seco
Jarye to make durilly addition 18' X 18' to pingly The estimated cost of the work to be done is \$ 150 -
The estimated cost of the work to be done is a 150
The size of the building is feet long, feet wide and feet high.
stories in the building are
The size of the building lot is $\frac{50}{x}$ $\frac{16}{5}$
The building will be 140 feet from the front lot line 8
line on the side and 24 feet from the side lat on the South
and feet from the rear lot line.
The outside walls are to be of Construction, construction.
Builder or Contractor Self of
Licensed House Mover
Licensed Plumber of
Licensed Electrician of
If a permit is granted the undersigned agrees on behalf of himself and the owner of the premises that all work will be in conformity to the facts stated in the foregoing application and that all work done will con- form with the zoning and building ordinance of the City of Brookings and the laws of the State of South Dakota.
Dated at Brookings, S. D. Day, 15, 195 / bdurn Malstal
Signature of Owner or Authorized Agent
Permit granted MAY 21 1951 195
Mayor or Chairman of the Board of Adjustment
Attest: 526
City Auditor and Secretary of the Board of Adjustment
City Maator and Decterally of the Board of Myasman